Zera Shimshon

by Rabbi Shimshon Chaim Nachmani zt"l Published Mantua 1778*

Chapter XXIX: Acharei Mot (Lev. 16:1–18:30)

Essay 1. The deaths of the righteous atone

מִדְרָשֹׁ רַבָּה אָמַר ר' חִיָּיא בַּר אַבָּא בְּאֶחָד בְּנִיסָן מֵתוּ בָּנָיו שֶׁל אַהְרֹן וְלָמָּה מַזְכִּיר מִיתָתָם בְּיוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים, אֶלָּא מְלַמֵּד בְּשׁם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרָת, וּמִנֵּין שֶׁיּוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים מְכַפֵּר, דְּכְתִיב "כִּי־בַיּוֹם הַזֶּה יְכַפֵּר עֲלֵיכֶם", וּמָנִּין שֶׁפִּיּרִים מְכַפֵּר, שָׁנָאֱמַר "נַיִּקְבְּרוּ אֶת־עַצְמוֹת־שָׁאוּל" וְכוּ' "וַיַּעָתַר אֱלֹהִים לָאָרֶץ" וְכוּ' עכ"ל.

There is a Midrash Rabbah:

Rabbi Chiya bar Abba said that on the first of Nissan, the sons of Aaron died. Why do we mention their death on Yom Kippur? Rather, it teaches that just as Yom Kippur atones, so too the deaths of the righteous atone. From where [do we know] that Yom Kippur atones? As it is written, "For on this day atonement shall be made for you [to purify you from all your sins; before the L-rd you shall be pure]." And from where [do we know] that the deaths of the righteous atone? As it is said, "And they buried the bones of Saul [and of his son Jonathan in Zela, in the territory of Benjamin, in the tomb of his father Kish; and when all that the king had commanded was done,] G-d responded to the plea of the land thereafter."

- Midrash Lev. Rabbah 20:12

צָרִיךְ עִיּוּן לָמָּה שׁוֹאֵל מִנֵּין שֶׁיּוֹם הַכִּיפּוּרִים מְכַפֵּר וְהָא זִיל קְרֵי בֵּי רַב הוּא דְּכַמָּה פְּעָמִים כָּתוּב בְּפָּרָשָׁה לְכַפֵּר עֲלֵיכֶם וְכוּ'.

וְעוֹד קָשֶׁה אִם כְּבָר לַמֵּד מִמְּה שֻׁמַזְכִּיר מִיתָתִם בְּיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים שֶׁמִיתָתִם מְכַפֶּרָת מֵה צוֹרֵךְ עוֹד מְפָּסוּק "וַיַּעָת אֱלֹהִים לְּאָרֶץ". וְעוֹד דְּפָסוּק זֶה נָאֲמֵר יוֹתֵר מִי"ב חֹדֶשׁ אַחַר שָׁמֵת, וְאֵיךְ מָצִי לְמֵילַף מִינֵּיה שָׁמִּיתָתִם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרֶת. וְעוֹד דְּכְסוֹף פֶּרָק חַלֶּק אָמְרִינַן צַדִּיק נִפְּטָר מִן הָעוֹלָם רָעָה בָּאָה לָעוֹלָם, וְאִיתָא נָמֵי שָׁם עַל פָּסוּק "וַיְהִי לְשִׁבְעַת הַנְּטִר מִן הָעוֹלָם רָעָה בָּאָה לָעוֹלָם, וְאִיתָא נָמֵי שֶׁם עַל פָּסוּק "וַיְהִי לְשִׁבְעַת הַנְּיִלְים וְמִצְּבֶּנָת הַפּוּרְעֲנוּת, וְאִם כִּדְבָרֵינוּ מִיתַּת הַצַּדִּיק הָיָה לוֹ לְהָבִיא טוֹבָה לָעוֹלָם וְלֹא רָעָה. וְעוֹד לְמָּה מִבְּבָרוֹ שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְעַבֶּבֶת וְכוּּי, תִיפּוֹק לִי דְּכָבֶר הַמִּיתָה כַּפָּרָה עַל הַכֹּל.

Question 1: It is necessary to investigate why [the author of the Midrash] asked from where we know that Yom Kippur atones, for that "is [something you could] go learn in a children's school," that a few times it is written in a parasha to atone for you.⁴

^{*} English translation: Copyright © 2023 by Charles S. Stein. Additional essays are at https://www.zstorah.com

¹ Lev. 16:30.

² II Sam. 21:14.

³ This saying is found in Horayot 4a; Sanhedrin 33b; and Shevuot 14b.

⁴ In addition to Lev. 16:30, Yom Kippur is discussed at Lev. 16:34, Lev. 23:28 and Num. 29:11.

Question 2: Also, it is difficult to understand if he already learned from the fact that their death is mentioned at Yom Kippur that their deaths atone, what further need was there for the verse, "G-d responded to the plea of the land."

Question 3: Also, this verse was said more than 12 months after [Shaul] died,⁵ and how do they find to deduce from it that the deaths of the righteous atone?

Question 4: Also, that at the end of the 11th chapter of tractate Sanhedrin entitled "All Israel have a share in the World-to-Come," it says, "When a righteous person passes from the world, evil comes to the world." However, it is also brought there on the verse, "And on the seventh day the waters of the Flood came upon the earth," from here "Rav said: These were the days of mourning of Methuselah; [and this is] to teach you that eulogies for the righteous prevent calamities." So how can the Gemara say elsewhere that when a righteous person passes from the world, evil comes to the world, if, as according to our words, the death of a righteous person will bring goodness to the world and not bad, if his death effects atonement? Also, why did they say that eulogies for the righteous prevent calamities, if we already brought out that the death is an atonement for everything?

וְגֵשׁ לוֹמֵר דְּבְפֶּרֶק ח' דְּיוֹמָא מָצִינוּ הַרְבֵּה חִילּוּקֵי כְּפָרָה, שֶׁיֵשׁ עֲבֵירוֹת שֶׁמִתכַּפְּרוֹת בִּתְשׁוּבָה לְבַדָּה וְגֵשׁ מֵהֶן שֶׁצְרִיכוֹת נָמֵי יוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים וְגֵשׁ שֶׁצְרִיכוֹת נַמֵי יִיסּוּרִין אוֹ מִיתַה, וָאִיתַא עוֹד שַׁם כַּמַה חִילּוּקִים בֵּין הַתִּשׁוּבָה מִיִּרְאָה לַתִּשׁוּבַה מֵאָהַבָּה.

It can be said that in the 8th chapter of tractate Yoma (86a) we find many distinctions of atonement, that there are transgressions that are atoned for by repentance alone, and some of them require repentance on the Day of Atonement, and there are those that require sufferings or death, and there are also some distinctions between repentance out of fear and repentance out of love.

וְהָנֵּה הַתְּשׁוּכָה שֶׁעוֹשִׂים הַבְּרִיּוֹת בְּמִיתַּת הָצְדִּיק בְּוַדֵּאי שֶׁהִיא תְשׁוּבָה מִיִּרְאָה, דּוּמְיָא לְמַאי דְּכְתִיב בְּהוֹשֵׁעַ "לְכוּ וְנָשׁוּבָה" וְכוּ "כִּי הוּא טָרָף" וְכוּ "יַדְ וְיַחָבְּשֵׁנוּ", כְּמוֹ שֶׁפֵּירֵשׁ הָרִי"ף שָׁם עַל הַהִיא דּגִדוֹלָה תְשׁוּבָה שֶׁוְדוֹנוֹת נַעֲשׁוֹת לָהֶם וְכוּ!.

Here, the repentance that people do at the death of a righteous person is certainly a repentance from fear, as evidenced by what was written in Hosea, "Come, let us turn back to the L-rd: He attacked, and He can heal us; He wounded, and He can bind us up." This is as the Rif¹⁰ explained there in his commentary on Ein Yaakov, Yoma 86b on the fact that Reish Lakish said, "Great is repentance, as [the person's] intentional sins are counted for him as unwitting transgressions."

⁵ Yevamot 78b–79a.

⁶ Sanhedrin 113b.

⁷ Gen.7:10.

⁸ Sanhedrin 108b.

⁹ Hosea 6:1.

¹⁰ This is not the earlier and more famous "Rif" [Rabbi Isaac Alfasi (1013-1103)], but rather Rabbi Josiah ben Joseph Pinto (c. 1565–c. 1648), Syrian rabbi and preacher, a disciple of Rabbi Chaim Vital. He wrote *Me'or Enayim* (Venice, 1643), a commentary on Rabbi Jacob ibn Habib's *Ein Yaakov*.

וּמֵעַתָּה אוֹמֵר הַמִּדְרָשׁ שֶׁכְּשֵׁם שֶׁיּוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים מְכַפֵּר לְגַמְרֵי עַל לֹא תַּעֲשֶׂה וְכַיּוֹצֵא בּוֹ אַחַר הַתְּשׁוּבָה מִיִּרְאָה, דְּאָמְרִינַן תְּשׁוּבָה תּוֹלָה וְיוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים מְכַפֵּר, וּכְמוֹ שֶׁפֵּירֵשׁ הָרִי"ף עַל הַהִיא דְּשָׁאַל ר' מַתְיָא בֶּן חָרָשׁ וְכוּ' עוֹד יֵשׁ לוֹמַר שֶׁהַתְּשׁוּבָה הַחְשׁוּבָה וְכוּ' וְעִיי"ש בָּאוֹרֶךְ.

From now on, the Midrash says that just as Yom Kippur completely atones for negative commandments and the like after repenting from fear, as it says, "repentance suspends [punishment] and Yom Kippur atones," and as the Rif explained on the fact that:

Rabbi Matya ben Charash asked Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya in Rome: Have you heard [the teaching that there are] four distinctions [in the process] of atonement that Rabbi Yishmael would derive? He said to him: They are [not four but] three [distinctions], and repentance is necessary with each one.

If one violates a positive mitzva and repents, he is forgiven even before he moves [from his place, i.e. immediately]. . .

If one violates a prohibition and repents, repentance suspends [his punishment] and Yom Kippur atones [for his sin] . . .

If one commits [a transgression that warrants] excommunication or [a sin punishable by] death [from the earthly] court and then repents, repentance and Yom Kippur suspend [his punishment], and suffering absolves [and completes the atonement]...

But one who has [caused] desecration of [G-d's] name, his repentance has no power to suspend [punishment], nor does Yom Kippur [have power] to atone [for his sin], nor does suffering [alone have power] to absolve [him]. Rather, all these suspend [punishment], and death absolves [him] . . .

- Yoma 86b

It can also be said that repentance is more important than..., and see there at length, where the Rif explains the words of the Gemara thus: because a person repented only out of fear, he also needs the atonement of Yom Kippur.

ּכָּדְּ מִיתַּת הַצַּדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרָת אַחַר הַתְּשׁוּבָה שֶׁיַּצְשׁוּ בְּנֵי דּוֹרוֹ אַף עַל פִּי שֶׁהָיא מִיְּרְאָה לְבַד. וְאַחַר כָּדְּ חוֹזֵר וּמִקְשֶׁה וּמִנֵּין שֶׁיּוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים מְכַפּר לְגַמְרֵי אָלָא אַחַר הַתְּשׁוּבָה מִיְרָאָה לְבַד, וְדִּילְמָא אֵינוֹ מְכַפּר לְגַמְרֵי אָלָא אַחַר הַתְּשׁוּבָה מַאָּהְבָה דִּוְקָא. וּמְתָרץ "כִּפּוּרִים מְכַפּר לְגַמְרֵי אַף אַחָר הַּתְשׁוּבָה מַיִּרְאָה לְבָּדְ שְׁיָיָא הַכָּפֶּל שֶׁהָיָה לוֹ לוֹמַר "כִּיּ־בַיּוֹם הַזֶּה יְכַפֵּר עֲלֵיכֶם" וְתוּ תִּנִּי הֵי תִּטְהָרוּ"? לָא, וּמַהוּ שֶׁחָזַר לוֹמַר לִפְנֵי ה' תִּטְהָרוּ"?

Thus the death of the righteous atones after the repentance made by the people of his generation, even it is was from fear alone. But afterwards, [Rabbi Chiya bar Abba] backtracks and questions, 'From where do we know that Yom Kippur atones completely.' Question 1 asked why Rabbi Chiyah would ask something that seemed obvious, but his intention was to investigate whether Yom Kippur atones even after repentance from fear alone? Perhaps [Yom Kippur] atones completely only specifically after the repentance from love. [Rabbi Chiyah] solves this question by citing the verse, "For on this day atonement shall be made for

you to purify you from all your sins; before the L-rd you shall be pure." In this verse the repetition is difficult, for [Scripture] could have said, "For on this day atonement shall be made for you from all your sins," and nothing more. What is the reason for the repetition of the additional words "to purify you," and why does [Scripture] return to say the conclusion, "before the L-rd you shall be pure"?

אֶלָּא וַדַּאי צָרִידְ לוֹמֵר כְּפֵירוּשׁ הָרִי"ף שָׁם שָׁאָם עָבָר עַל לֹא תַּעֲשֶׂה וְעָשָׂה תְּשׁוּבָה מִיּרְאָה הִיא תּוֹלָה עַד שֶׁיָבֹא יוֹם הַכָּפּוּרִים וִיכַפֵּר, שֶׁנֶּאֲמַר "כִּי־בַיּוֹם הַזָּה יְכַפֵּר עֲלֵיכֶם" גְּמַר הַכַּפָּרָה "מִכֹּל חַטֹאתֵיכֶם", אֲבָל אִם הַתְּשׁוּבָה לְכַבְּי שְׁשָׁב בְּכָל לְבּוֹ, אָז תְּטַהְרוּ עִם הַתְּשׁוּבָה מִכֹּל וָבֵל וְאֵין צוֹרֵדְ כְּלָל לְכַבָּר יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים. וְנֶפֶשׁ כִּי "ה' יִרְאָה לִלַבָב" שֶׁשָׁב בְּכָל לִבּוֹ, אָז תְּטַהְרוּ עִם הַתְּשׁוּבָה מִכֹּל וְבֵל וְאֵין צוֹרֵדְ כְּלָל לְכַבָּרת יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים.

Rather, it should surely be said, according to the interpretation of the Rif there, that if one transgresses a negative commandment and repents, [punishment] will be suspended until Yom Kippur comes and atones for the transgression, as it is said, "For on this day atonement shall be made for you," the conclusion of the atonement is "from all your sins," but if the repentance was before G-d, that is from the heart and soul because, "the L-rd sees into the heart," that he repented with all his heart, then you will be cleansed with the repentance utterly, and there is no need at all for the atonement of Yom Kippur.

וְאַחַר זָה שָׁאַל וּמְנַּיִן שֶׁמִּיתָתָם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרֶת, דְּבִשְׁלָמָא יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים יָכוֹל לְכַפֵּר מִפְּנֵי שֶׁהַתְּשׁוּבָה קַדְמָה לוֹ וְהִיא תּוֹלָה וְאַחַר כַּךְּ הַיּוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים מִכַפֵּר, תּאמֵר מִיתַתָם שֵׁל צַדִּיקִים שֵׁאַחַר שֵׁמֵתוּ, הַעֲם חוֹזַרִים בַּתְּשׁוּבָה.

After this, he asked, "From where do we know that the deaths of the righteous atone." Granted, Yom Kippur is able to atone because the repentance precedes it and suspends the punishment and afterward Yom Kippur atones. You can say that the deaths of the righteous atone because after they die, the people return in repentance. I.e., they are so shaken by the death of the righteous person, that they repent.

הָא לָמָה זָה דּוֹמֶה לְמִי שֶׁחֵטְא בְּלֹא תַּעֲשֶׂה וְלֹא שֶׁב בִּתְשׁוּבָה קוֹדֵם יוֹם כִּפּוּר וְיוֹם כִּפּוּר לֹא עָשָׂה לוֹ כְּלוּם, וְאָם יָשׁוּב אַחֵּר כִּפּוּר תֹאמֵר שֶׁהַתְשׁוּבָה שֶׁעוֹשֶׂה עַתָּה תּוֹלָה וְיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים שֶׁעָבַר מְכַפֵּר זָה וַדַּאִי לֹא, שֶׁבֵּיוָן שֶׁעָבַר הַיּוֹם אֵין לוֹ כַּפָּרָה גְּמוּרָה עַד יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים אַחֶר.

To what is this similar? To one who violated a negative commandment who did not turn in repentance before Yom Kippur, and Yom Kippur did nothing for him. If he repents after Yom Kippur, would you say that the repentance he has done now suspends his punishment and the Yom Kippur that has passed atones? Surely not, for since the Day of Atonement has already passed, he has no complete atonement until another Yom Kippur. So why would death of the righteous atone, if the people don't repent until after the death?

. .

¹¹ I Sam. 16:7.

אף כָּאן בְּמִיתָתִם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים בִּשְׁלָמָא אִם הָעָם יַצֲשׁוּ תְּשׁוּבָה קוֹדֶם מוֹתָם אָז הָיָה מָקוֹם לְמִיתָת הַצַּדִּיקִים לְכַפֵּר כְּמוֹ יוֹם הַכְּפּוֹּרִים. צְבָל זָה אִי אָפְשָׁר לוֹמֵר כֵּן, מִשׁוּם דְּאִי הָכִי לֹא הָיָה מֵת הַצַּדִּיק אִם הַדּוֹר הָיָה שֶׁב בִּתְשׁוּבָה בְּחַיָּיו שֶׁהָרֵי הַצְּדִּיק נִתְפָּס בֶּעָוֹן הַדּוֹר. וְאִם כֵּן לֹא הָנֵי כְּלָל דּוּמְיָא דְּיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים וְאֵין לָנוּ עוֹד לִימוּד מַסְפִּיק שֶׁמִיתַּת הַצַּדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרָת, וְעַל כַּרְחַךְּ הָיָה צָרִידְ לוֹמֵר שֶׁהַתִּשׁוּבָה לְאָחַר מִיתַּת הַצַּדִּיק מוֹעֶלֶת כְּמוֹ הַתְּשׁוּבָה קוֹבַם יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים.

Even here, in the death of righteous, granted, if the people had repented <u>before</u> their death, then there would be a place for the death of the righteous to atone as does Yom Kippur. But it's impossible to say this, because the righteous person would not have died if the generation had returned in repentance in his lifetime, for the soul of the righteous person is seized for the guilt of the generation. If so, [the death of the righteous] is not at all similar to Yom Kippur. This is why Rabbi Chiyah bar Abba asked Question 2: If we know from the mention at Yom Kippur of the deaths of the sons of Aaron that the deaths of the righteous atone, why do we need additional proof. The answer is that we see that there are distinctions between Yom Kippur and the deaths of the righteous, as repentance comes first, in the case of Yom Kippur, but afterwards, in the case of the deaths of the righteous. We do not have sufficient learning that the death of the righteous atones, and he necessarily had to say that the repentance after the death of the righteous was as effective as the repentance prior to Yom Kippur.

וְלָכֵן שׁוֹאֵל וּמְנֵּין שֶׁאַף לְאַחַר מִיתָתִם מוֹעֶלֶת הַמְּשׁוּכָה מֵה שֶׁאֵין כֵּן בְּיוֹם הַכְּפּוּרִים, תַּלְמוּד לוֹמֵר "וַיִּקְבְּרוּ" וְכוּי "וַיֵּעָתֵר אֲהָרִיבֹן", שֶׁמְּהָ אָנוּ שׁוֹמְעִים שָׁאַף עַל פִּי שֶׁבְּוַדֵּאי כְּכָר עֲשׁוּ מְשׁוּבָה מִיִּרְאַת הָעוֹנֶשׁ דְּהַיִינוּ הָרָעֵב שֶׁהָיָה לָהֶם בְּכָר שָׁלוֹשׁ שָׁנִים, אַף עַל פִּי כֵּן לֹא נְעֲנוּ אֶלָּא לְאַחַר שֶׁקְבְרוּ עֲצָמוֹת שָׁאוּל וּגְמֵלוֹ חֶסֶד עִמוֹ כְּרָאוִי. דְּשְׁמַע מִינָה שֶׁהְשִׁבּה לֹא נִתְקבְּלָה אֶלָא בְּשְׁבִיל מִיתַּת הַצַּדִּיק, וְאַף עַל פִּי שֶׁמִיתַּת הַצַּדִיק דְּהַיִינוּ שָׁאוּל קַּדְמָה לַתְּשׁוּבָה שֶׁלְהָם מִכָּל מְקוֹם הוֹאִיל לֹא נִתְקבְּלָה אֶלָּא בְּשְׁבִיל מִיתַּת הַצִּדִּיק, וְאַף עַל פִּי שֶׁמִיתַת הַצַּדִיק דְּהַיִּנוּ שְׁאוּל הַבְּיִבְּה אָיָהָה לִיקוּט בְּבְּיִים שְׁעוֹשִׁים שָׁתִיּה, מְשׁוּם שֶׁעְקֶּר גְּמִילוּת חֲסָדִים שֶׁעוֹשִׁים עָבְּהֹים הַמְּיתָה קוֹנָם הַקְּבוּרָה. וְשַׁפִּיר נָקְרָא שָׁהַהְשׁוּבָה קְּדְמָה כְּמוֹ בְּיוֹם הַכְּפּוּרִים, אֲבָל אִין הָכִי נָמֵי שֶׁלְּאַחַר הַקְבוּרָה אֵינָה לְחוּד. לְמָרָא שְׁהַבְּירִה מְדֹּה כְּמוֹ בְּיוֹם הַכְּפּוּרִים, אֲבָל אִין הָכִי נָמֵי שֶּׁלְּאחַר הַקְבוּרָה אִינָה לְחוּד.

Therefore, [Rabbi Chiya bar Abba] asks, How do we know that after their death, the repentance of the generation is effective, something that isn't true for Yom Kippur. As proof, he brings Scripture that says, "And they buried the bones of Saul . . .; and when all that the king had commanded was done, G-d responded to the plea of the land thereafter." Question 3 had noted that this verse was said more than a year after Saul's death, and asked how we could deduce from it that the deaths of the righteous atone. Question 4 asked about the teaching that eulogies for the righteous prevent calamities. From this verse, we hear that even though [the people] certainly repented from fear of punishment—which was the famine that they'd already suffered for three years 12—nevertheless, they were only answered after they buried the bones of Saul and showed him kindness, as appropriate. We hear from this that the repentance was only accepted because of the death of the righteous man, and even though the death of the righteous man—that is, Saul—preceded their repentance, nevertheless since [their repentance] preceded the burial it was sufficient. That is, we hold that the day of gathering

¹² Chapter 21 of II Samuel tells of a three-year famine at the start of David's reign. G-d explained this was a punishment for Saul's genocide of the Gibeonites, a remnant of the Amorites, whom Israel had promised to spare but whom Saul had massacred. David asked the Gibeonites how he could make amends, hoping this would end the famine. The Gibeonites asked for seven of Saul's descendants to kill, and David turned them over. David later took the bones of Saul, Jonathan and those killed by the Gibeonites and buried them in the tomb of Kish in Zelah. This pleased G-d and the famine ended.

a person's bones for burial is mourned like the day of death,¹³ because the principal act of kindness performed with the deceased is the burial. It's fine if the repentance happened beforehand, as with Yom Kippur, but it is indeed so that after the burial, it would not atone completely, rather it would suspend the punishment as would a repentance from fear alone.

ְוָנִיחָא הַשְׁתָּא שֶׁאָמְרוּ הָסְפֵּדֵן שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְעַכֶּבֶת הַפּּוּרְעָנוּת דְּמַשְׁמָע שֶׁאַחַר כָּדְ עָתִיד לָבֹא וְלֹא אָמְרוּ מְכַבֶּּרֶת לְגַמְרֵי, מְשׁוּם דְּמִייְרֵי הֵיכָא דֹלֹא שֶׁבּוֹ שֶׁאַין לָהֶם רַק זְכוּת הַהָּסְפֵּד לְחוֹדֵיה, אִי נְמֵי בְּהָסְפֵּד שֻׁעוֹשִׁים אַחַר הַקְּבוּרָה שָׁאַף אִם יָשׁוּבוּ אִם דְּמֵיְירֵי הַעֹּבְרָת לְגַמְרֵי כִנ"ל. אֵינַה תִּשׁוּבַה מֵאַהַבָּה אֵינַה מָכַפֶּרַת לְגַמְרֵי כִנ"ל.

Now it is fine that it says that the eulogies of the righteous prevent calamity, for the meaning is that afterward, in the future to come, and it's not saying that it atones completely, that it's talking about where they didn't repent, that they only have the merit of the eulogy alone. Alternatively, with a eulogy that is made after the burial, that even if they repent, if it's not a repentance from love, it does not atone completely.

ּוְעוֹד יֵשׁ לוֹמֵר דְּאִיתָא בְּמִדְרָשׁ רַכָּה עַל כָּסוּק "בְּזֹאת יָבאׁ אַהֲרֹן אֶל־הַלֹּדֶשׁ", זֶה שֶׁאָמֵר הַכָּתוּב "כִּי בְתַחְבֵּלוֹת הַעֲשֶׂה־לְּדְ מִלְחָמָה". ר' נָתַן וְר' אַחָא בְּשֵׁם ר' סִימוֹן אוֹמֵר, אָם עָשִּׁיתָ חָבִילוֹת שֶׁל עֲבֵירוֹת עֲשֵׂה כְּנֶגְדָן חָבִילוֹת שֶׁל מִצְוֹת, עֵינַיִם רְמוֹת וְהָיוּ לְטֹטָפֹת וְכוּ' ועיי"ש. וְהַיָּפֶה תֹּאַר הִרְבָּה לְהַקְשׁוֹת עַל מִדְרָשׁ זֶה וְעיי"ש.

It can also be said that it's brought in Midrash Lev. Rabbah 21:5 on the verse, "Thus only shall Aaron enter the holy place: with a bull of the herd for a sin offering and a ram for a burnt offering" 14:

This is what Scripture says: "For by stratagems you wage war, and victory comes with much planning." Rabbi Natan and Rabbi Acha say in the name of Rabbi Simon: If you have committed bundles of violations, offset against them bundles of mitzvot. [E.g., the sin of] "A haughty bearing" [is countered with the mitzva of the head tefillin:] "and let them serve as a symbol on your forehead." [The sin of] "a lying tongue" [is countered with the mitzva of] "and teach [My words] to your children." [The sin of] "hands that shed innocent blood" [is countered with the mitzva of the arm tefillin] "bind them as a sign on your hand." [The sin of] "hands that shed innocent blood" [The sin of] "hands that shed innocent b

- Lev. Rabbah 21:5

The Yafeh To'ar asks many questions on this Midrash.

¹³ Moed Katan 8a.

¹⁴ Lev. 16:3.

¹⁵ Prov. 24:6.

¹⁶ Prov. 6:17.

¹⁷ Deut. 6:8.

¹⁸ Prov. 6:17.

¹⁹ Deut. 11:19.

²⁰ Prov. 6:17.

²¹ Deut. 6:8.

וּלְדִידֵן נָרְאֶה שֶׁיּוּבַן שֶׁפִּיר בַּמֶּה שֶׁנּוֹדַע כִּי הָאָדָם נִבְרָא לְתַקֵּן אֵיזֶה דָּבָר בָּעוֹלָם אוֹ אֵיזוֹ מִצְנָה, וָכֹל עוֹד שֶׁלֹא הִשְׁלִים תִּיקוּנוֹ הָרֵי הוּא כָּלָא הָיָה וְטוֹב מִמֶּנוּ הַנֵּפֶל, וְכָתַב הָרֵב הַקְּדוֹשׁ שֶׁהַיֵּצֶר הָרַע הַמֵּסִית אֶת הָאָדָם לַחֲטוֹא מִשִּׁיאוֹ יוֹתֵר לְקַלְקֵל בְּאוֹתוֹ דַּבַר שַבֵּא לִתַקּן מִשָּאַר מִצִּוֹת.

For us, it appears well understood from what is known, that man was created to fix some matter in the world or [to perform] some mitzvah, and as long as he does not complete his correction, he is a prisoner and a miscarriage is better than him. The Rav haKadosh, the Arizal, writes that the evil inclination that entices a man to sin entices him more to spoil the same matter that he came to correct than other mitzvot.²²

ּוְאָמֵר הַמִּדְרָשׁ לֹא דֵּי שֶׁתַּצְשֶׂה תְּשׁוּבָה מֵעֲוֹנוֹתֶיךּ, כִּי אַף עַל כִּי שֶׁתַּצֵא זַכַּאי בְּדִינָךְ עֲדַיִין לֹא הוֹעַלְתָּ כְּלוּם בַּתִּיקוּן הָעוֹלָם. וְלָכֵן הַדֶּרֶךְ הַנָּכוֹן שֶׁבְּמַה שֶׁפָּגִמְתָּ תָּשׁוּב לְקַיֵּם הַמִּצְוֹת, כִּי בְּוַדֵּאי תַּעֲשֶׂה הַחוֹבָה הַמּוּטֶלֶת עָלֶיךְ וּבְמַה שֶׁקּלְקַלְתָּ הוּא הָאוֹת שֵׁאוֹתוֹ הַדֵּבָר הַיָּה צַרִיךְ תִּיקוּן.

The Midrash said, it is not enough that you repent of your sins, because even if you come out innocent in your trial, you still have not accomplished anything repairing the world. Therefore, the right path for the harm you have caused is to return to fulfilling the mitzvot, because you will certainly fulfil the duty imposed on you, and what you spoiled is the sign that the same thing needed correction on your part.

ּוּלְפִי זֶה אָמַר דָּוִד הַמֶּלֶךְ עָלָיו הַשָּׁלוֹם אַשְׁרֵי תְמִימִי־דָרֶךְ הַהֹּלְכִים וְכוּ' "אַשְׁרֵי נִצְרֵי עֵדֹתִיו" וְכוּ' "אַף לֹא־פָעֲלוּ עַוְלָה" וְכוּ', אַשְׁרֵיהָם לַצַּדִיקִים גִּמוּרִים שֶׁמֵעוֹלָם לֹא חָטְאוּ וְנִקְרְאוּ "הְּמִימִים" שֻׁתָּמִיד הָלְכוּ בְּתוֹרַת ה'. וְאַשְׁרֵיהֶם אַף לְבַעֲלֵי הְשׁוּבָה שֶׁמֵעוֹלָם לֹא חָטְאוּ וְנָקְרְאוּ "הְמִימִים" שֶׁתָּמִיה הָם עוֹשִׁים כְּדֵי לְתַקֵּן עַצְמָם, "אַף לֹא־פָּעֲלוּ שֶׁמֵעַתָּה הָם "נֹצְרֵי עֵדֹתִיו" וְיִדְרְשׁוּ אֶת ה' בְּכָל לֵב שֶׁיִמְחוֹל לָהֶם עֲוֹנֹתֵיהֶם. וּמָה הָם עוֹשִׁים כְּדֵי לָתַקּן עַצְמָם, שֶׁרָצָה הקב"ה עּוְלָה" דְּהַיִינוּ סִילּוּק הָרַע, וְעוֹד שֶׁבְּמַה שֶׁחָטְאוּ חָזְרוּ לְתַקּן בְּמְצְוֹת, וְזָהוּ "בִּדְרָכִיו הָלָכוּ" בְּאוֹתָן הַדְּרָכִים שֶׁרָצָה הקב"ה שֶׁשַלְּחֵם בְּדֵי שֻׁיְתַקּנוּ אוֹתָם רְהֵם לְמֵדִים אוֹתָם בְּמֵה שֶׁקּלְקְלוּ בָּהֶם.

According to this, King David, peace be upon him, said: "Happy are those whose way is blameless, who follow the teaching of the L-rd. Happy are those who observe His decrees, who turn to Him wholeheartedly. They have done no wrong, but have followed His ways." Fortunate are the completely righteous who have never sinned, and they are called "blameless," as they always followed G-d's Torah. Also, even the penitents are fortunate, for now they "observe His decrees" and turn toward G-d with all their heart, that He will forgive their sins. What did they do to correct themselves? "They have done no wrong," that is, they have removed the evil, and also, regarding what they previously sinned, they have returned to make amends with mitzvot. This is the meaning of "but have followed His ways," in the same paths that the Holy One, Blessed be He, wanted, that He sent them in order that they correct them, and they learned them by what they had ruined.

7

²² This teaching of the Arizal is recorded in the sefer of his principal student, Chayim Vital, Etz Chaim, 49:5.

²³ Ps. 119:1–3.

וְזֶהוּ הַטַּעַם נָמֵי שֶׁמִּיתָתָם וְהָסְפֵּדֵם שֶׁל צַדִּיקִים מְכַפֶּרֶת, לְפִי שֶׁהַדּוֹר חַטְאוּ בְּמַה שֶׁלֹא שָׁמְעוּ לְקוֹל הַצַּדִּיק בְּעוֹד שֶׁהָיָה חֵי וְהָיָה מוֹכִיחָם וּפָגְמוּ בִּכְבוֹדוֹ, וּמֵעַתָּה בַּכָּבוֹד שֶׁעוֹשִׁים לוֹ אַחַר מוֹתוֹ וּמִכֶּל שֶׁכֵּן אָם יָשׁוּבוּ מֵחַטָּאתָם, חוֹזְרִים לְתַקֵּן בְּמַה שֶׁקּלְקְלוּ.

This is the reason why the death and eulogy of the righteous atone, according to the fact that the generation sinned in that they did not listen to the voice of the righteous man while he was alive and while he rebuked them, and they damaged his honor. From now on, by the honor they show him after his death, and even more so if they turn from their sin, they return to correct what they spoiled.

* * *