Zera Shimshon

by Rabbi Shimshon Chaim Nachmani zt"l Published Mantua 1778*

Chapter LI: Nitzavim (Deut. 29:9-30:20)

Essay 5. The life and the goodness, the death and the misfortune

פְּסוּק "רְאֵה נָתַתִּי לְפָנֶיךּ הַיּוֹם אֶת־הַחַיִּים וְאֶת־הַטּוֹב וְאֶת־הַפֶּנֶת [וְאֶת־הָרָע]". קֵשֶׁה שֶׁהָיָה לוֹ לוֹמֵר מִתְּחָלָּה "אֶת־הַפֶּנֶת וְאֶת־הָרָע" וְאַחַר כָּךְ "אֶת־הַחַיִּים וְאֶת־הַטוֹב", דְּהָכִי אָמְרינֵן בְּמִדְרָשׁ שֶׁיִּצְחָק אָמַר "אֹרְרֶיךְ אָרוּר וּמְבָרֲכֶיךְ בָּרוּךְ" וּבִלְעַם אָמֵר לְהָפֶּדְ, לְפִי שֶׁהַצַּדִּיקִים תְּחָלָתָו יִיסּוּרִיו וְסוֹפָן שׁלְנָה וְהָרְשָׁעִים תְּחַלָּתָו שַׁלְנָה וְסוֹפָן יִיסּוּרִין.

There is a verse: "See, I set before you today the life and the goodness, the death [and the misfortune]" (Deut. 30:15). This is difficult, it should have said, "the death and the misfortune" at the beginning, and afterwards "the life and the goodness." Why? For thus, it is written in the midrash, Gen. Rabbah 66:4, that Isaac said, "Accursed be they who curse you, blessed they who bless you," but Balaam said the opposite, because the righteous start with sufferings and end with tranquility, whereas the wicked begin with tranquility and end with sufferings.

ּוְגֵשׁ לוֹמַר דְּהָכָא לֹא הָיָה אֶפְשָׁר לוֹמַר תְּחִלָּה "אָת־הַמָּנָת וְאֶת־הָרָע", דְּאִם כֵּן הַנָה מַשְׁמָע שֶׁלְאַחַר שֶׁבָּא הָרָע גֵשׁ תַּקְּנָה לוְכּוֹת בְּטוֹב, וְזָה אֵינוֹ שֶׁלְעוֹלָם צָרִיךְ שֶׁהָאָדָם יַקְדִּים תְּפִלָּה לְצָרָה, וְעוֹד אָמְרינַן דֶּלֶת הַנְּנְעֶלֶת לֹא בִּמְהַרָה תִּפָּתַח, וּמִשׁוּם הָכִי הָקְדִים הַחַיִּים וְהַטוֹב שֶׁיִּדְבֵּק בְּאֵלוּ קוֹדֵם שֶׁיָבוֹא הָרַע חָס וְשָׁלוֹם.

It can be said that here it's not possible to first say, "the death and the misfortune," for if so, it would mean that after the misfortune comes, there's a remedy to merit good. That is not [the case], for someone should always say a prayer before trouble [arrives].³ It also says, "a door that is locked will not be opened quickly," and because of this, the life and the goodness must precede [the death and the misfortune in the verse], such that one will adhere to these, life and goodness, before the misfortune will come into a person's life, G-d forbid.

1

^{*} English translation: Copyright © 2021 by Charles S. Stein. More essays are at https://www.zstorah.com

¹ Gen 27:29.

² Num. 24:9, "Blessed are they who bless you; accursed they who curse you!"

³ In the first essay for Chayei Sarah, we read: "Charity needs to always be [given] before judgment comes [upon the giver], because we don't placate someone at the time of his anger (Pirkei Avot 4:18)." I.e., if G-d is angry at a person, that isn't the time to try to placate Him. That principle would also apply to prayer.

⁴ Bava Kamma 80b.

ּוְעוֹד יֵשׁ לְהַקְשׁוֹת עַל הַפָּסוּק דּלְפִּי מַאי דְּאָמְרינַן בְּפֶרֶק קַמָּא דְּתַעֲנִית דְּכִי יָהֵיב רַחֲמָנָא שׁוּבְעָא לְחַיֵּי הוּא דְּיָהֵיב לֹא הָוָה, צָרידְ קְרָא לְמֵימַר אֶלָּא רְאָה נָתִתִּי לְפָנֶידְ הַטוֹב, דִּרְשָׁיֵשׁ הַטוֹב בְּנִדָּאי יֵשׁ הַחַיִּים. וְלָמָּה כָּתַב נָמִי "אֶת־הַחַיִּים"?

We can also question the verse according to the first chapter of tracate Ta'anit (page 8b), "as when the Merciful One provides plenty, He gives it for [the sake of] the living." Thus, Scripture needed to say only, "See, I set before you today the goodness," for when there is the goodness, certainly there will be the life! So why does it also say "the life"?

ְוַיֵשׁ לּוֹמֵר לְפִי שֶׁהָרְשָׁעִים קְרוּיִים מֵתִים וּתְפָלֶתָן אֵינָה נִשְׁמַעַת כְּדְכְתִיב "וּבְפָּרְשְׂכֶם כַּפַּיכֶם" וְכוּ' "מִי־בִקּשׁ זֹאת מִיֶּדְכֶם" וְכוּ'? וְאָם כֵּן צָרִיךְ מִתְּחָלָּה שֶׁהָאָדָם יְבַקּשׁ לוֹ חַיִּים עִם הַתְּשׁוּבָה, דְּ"וָשָׁב וְרָפָּא לוֹ" כְּתִיב, וְאַחַר כָּךְּ יִתְפַּלֵּל שֶׁיָבוֹא לוֹ הַטּוֹב שָׁאָז תִּהְיֶה תְּפִלְתוֹ נִשְׁמַעַת.

It can be said that the wicked are called "dead," and their prayers are not heard, as it is written, "And when you lift up your hands, I will turn My eyes away from you; Though you pray at length, I will not listen. Your hands are stained with crime." "Who requested this from your hands?" I.e., G-d is asking rhetorically, "Did I request prayers and sacrifices from sinners?" That being the case, it is necessary from the start that the man will request life with the repentance, for "repent and be healed" is written. In other words, if a wicked person is considered dead, the verse is telling him, repent and choose life! That's why the verse includes "the life." Afterward, i.e., after repenting and no longer being in the category of an unrepentant sinner, then he should pray that the goodness will come to him, for then his prayer will be heard.

נעֲדַיִין יֵשׁ לְדַקְדֵק דְּבָשְׁלָמָא רֵישֵׁיה דְּקְרָא נִיחָא שֶׁמְּתְחַלָּה יָתַן לוֹ הַחַיִּים וְאַחַר כָּדְ יוֹסִיף לָתַת לוֹ הַטוֹב וּמְשׁוּם הָכִי אָמַר קְרָא אֶת־הַחַיִּים וְאֶת־הַטוֹב. אֲבָל סֵיפִיה דְּקָרָא לֹא נִיחָא דְ"אֶת־הַמֶּנֶת וְאֶת־הָרָע" מַשְׁמָע שֶׁאַחַר הַמָּנֶת יִתֵּן לוֹ הָרַע וְזָה אִי אֶפְשָׁר דְּלְאַחֵר שָׁמֵת אֵינוֹ יוֹדַעַ עוֹד בֵּין טוֹב לְרַע. וְאֵין לוֹמֵר דְּמַיִירִי בְּעוֹנֶשׁ עוֹלָם הַבָּא בְּגֵיהִנָּם דְּהָא פְּשָׁטֵיה דְּקְרָא מַיִירִי בָּעוֹלָם הַגָּה דַּוְקָא.

We still need to check [this]: Granted, at the beginning of the verse, it's convenient to our understanding, that from the beginning, He gives [the repentant sinner] the life, and afterward, He gives him the goodness, and because of this, the verse says, "the life and the goodness." But the end of the verse is not convenient to our understanding, for [it says] "the death and the misfortune," meaning that after death He will give him the misfortune. In this World, this is impossible, for after death, he will not know between goodness and misfortune. You can't say that it's speaking of punishment in the World to Come, in Gehenna, for it's obvious that the verse is specifically talking about this World.

⁵ Berachot 18b.

⁶ Prov. 15:29.

⁷ Isaiah 1:15.

⁸ Isaiah 1:12.

⁹ Isaiah 6:10.

ְוָיֵשׁ לוֹמַר דְּכַּנְוֹנַת הַכָּתוּב הִיא כָּךְ, שֶׁלְפְעָמִים יִתֵּן לוֹ הַמֶּנֶת מִיָּד וְלְפְעָמִים יִהְיֶה לוֹ הַמֶּנֶת אַחַר יִיסוּרִין קָשִׁים וְרָעִים שֶׁהֵם מֵר מְמָנֶת וְכִי דְּבָּל כָּרְחַךְּ אַתָּה חֵי בְּעַל כָּרְחַךְּ אַתָּה מֵת, וְכֵן בְּפֶרֶק ג' דְּכְתוּבוֹת אִלּוּלֵי נַגְּדוּה לְחַנַּנְיָה מִישָׁאֵל וַעֲזַרְיָה מָשְׁאֵל וַעֲזַרְיָה פָּלֶחוּ לְצַלְמָא. וְכֵן בְּפֶרֶק ז' דִּמְצִיעָא אִי מִקְטֵל קְטָלוּ לְהַהוּא גַּבְרָא, לָא מְגַלִינָא, וְאִי נְגוּדֵי מְנַגְּדֵי לֵיה, מְגַלִינָא. וְכֵן בְּמָתְאוֹנְנִים, רְשַׁעִים הָיוּ מִצְּעֲרִים וְהוֹלְכִים "עַד חֹדֵשׁ יָמִים" וְהַכְּשֵׁרִים מֵתוּ מִיָּיָּך, וְאַף רֵישִׁיה דְּקְרָא מִתְפַּרֵשׁ הַכִּי כנּ"ל.

It can be said that the intent of the second part of the verse is thus: that sometimes He gives [the sinner] death immediately, and sometimes he will have death after difficult and bad sufferings that are worse than death. It was taught that "against your will you live, against your will you will die," i.e., a person doesn't choose the time (or conditions) of his death, or how much suffering he will experience beforehand.

Also in the third chapter of tractate Ketubot (32b), the rabbis discussed that, "Perhaps [the punishment of] lashes is [more] severe [than the threat of death], as Rav said: Had they flogged Hananiah, Mishael, and Azariah, they would have worshipped an idol." The men had refused to bow to an image of Nebuchadnezzar, the king of Babylon, and they were then thrown into a fiery furnace. They were saved by a miracle. Rav is suggesting that the threat of a quick death from the furnace was not enough to make them worship an idol, but the fear of lashes might have been enough.

Also, in the seventh chapter of tractate Bava Metzia (86a), we find that a messenger sent word to Rabba bar Nachmani, "I will leave this [inn and will not disclose your location]. [Even] if they will kill that man [i.e., me], I will not disclose [your location]. But if they will beat him [i.e., me], I will disclose [your whereabouts, as I cannot bear being tortured]."

Also, in the section of the Torah talking about the Israelites complaining bitterly about not having meat, 12 the wicked suffered continuously "for an entire month," 13 but the proper ones died immediately, 14 and even the beginning of the verse is interpreted thus, as above, that the sinner is considered dead, and he should repent and choose life, and then his prayers for goodness will be heard and answered.

* * *

¹⁰ Pirkei Avoit 4:22.

¹¹ Daniel, chapter 3.

¹² Num. 11:1.

¹³ Num. 11:19–20, "You shall eat not one day, not two, not even five days or ten or twenty, but <u>an entire month</u>, until it comes out of your nostrils and becomes loathsome to you. For you have rejected the L-rd who is among you, by whining before Him and saying, 'Oh, why did we ever leave Egypt!' "

¹⁴ Num. 11:33, "The meat was still between their teeth, nor yet chewed, when the anger of the L-rd blazed forth against the people and the L-rd struck the people with a very severe plague." The translator has not identified a source that the fit ones died immediately, and Sforno comments that the ones who had said, "Why did we leave Egypt" died immediately, even before the meat reached their stomachs, and that the month of suffering was for those who had complained without actually having experienced a craving for meat. However, in Num. 11:15, Moses was so aggrieved by the complaints of the people that he beseeched G-d, "If You would deal thus with me, kill me rather, I beg You, and let me see no more of my wretchedness!" Thus, one can understand that someone might prefer a quick death to a prolonged torment.